



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

A REPLY TO PROFESSOR TARBELL

In reviewing my monograph on *Brygos* in *Classical Philology* I, pp. 191 ff., Professor Tarbell has so adversely criticized my work that it is impossible for me, with justice to myself, to let his remarks pass unchallenged. He says, in the first place, that I "blundered egregiously in reporting Hartwig," when I claimed that this writer assigned to *Brygos* thirty-eight characteristics. I find, after verifying my work, that all but one of those which I cite are given by Hartwig. I should be glad to furnish the references. My error in attributing to *Brygos* the characteristic that "figures reclining on couches are covered to the waist by the himation" is not so much a misunderstanding of Hartwig as an error in note-taking. On p. 74 I say that "Hartwig illustrates this characteristic by Pl. XXXV of his *Meisterschalen*," whereas I should have given Pl. XXXIV, where the feature discussed by Professor Tarbell does appear. I was thus led to interpret Hartwig to fit what I thought he was illustrating on Pl. XXXV.

Mr. Tarbell further states that a somewhat close scrutiny of my citations "from Furtwängler, Hauser, and Kretschmer has revealed similar inaccuracies sown broadcast." I had hoped by this time to have in my hands letters from these scholars relative to the matter. I lack one from Furtwängler. I have therefore examined my citations from him and find them correct. Kretschmer's reply is to the effect that I have not cited him "ganz genau," inasmuch as I make him say that "*Brygos* may have come from Crete," whereas he actually says that the writer of the inscription of the vase under discussion "aus Kreta stammte." As it is generally accepted that this vase is by *Brygos*, and as Kretschmer himself, without dissent, mentions Dümmler's attribution of it to *Brygos*, it seems to be rather a question of terms than of ideas. Hauser's answer is: "Der Unterschied zwischen dem, was Sie mich sagen lassen und was ich sagen wollte, ist ein geringer and doesn't matter. This remark was in reference to the only citation on which Hauser differed from me—p. 115, n. 3, of my monograph.

Mr. Tarbell's criticism of my method as mechanical expresses his personal opinion of a method of work not peculiar to myself, and therefore hardly demands an answer. But it is worth noting that the characteristics which he used in describing a *kantharos* "from the factory of *Brygos*" are in part those that I obtained by the method he describes as mechanical.

OLIVER S. TONKS

REJOINDER

In Upper Egypt, where Dr. Tonks's communication reaches me, it is impossible for me to make a detailed rejoinder. The points at issue must be left to the judgment of those who care to examine them.

F. B. T.